

## TRAFFIC CONGESTION

### *Motion*

Resumed from 24 September on the following motion moved by Ms R. Saffioti —

That this house condemns the Minister for Transport for his false claims that he has fixed congestion in Western Australia.

**MR D.C. NALDER (Alfred Cove — Minister for Transport)** [4.02 pm]: I rise in response to the three hours of debate that occurred last sitting and I just want to contribute, for the record, what the government is doing in response to the congestion on the roads throughout the city of Perth. It comes on the back of information supplied by Main Roads that showed the morning peak period travel times from metropolitan centres to the Perth central area. At the time I mentioned a couple of the roads and how travel times had improved from 2009 through to 2013–14. At the same time, I acknowledge that on one of the eight routes I have listed in front of me the travel times did get worse by two minutes in that time.

I have a couple of retorts to the comments made by the member for West Swan. She extolled the virtues of traffic flow in Western Australia, but the first five minutes of her argument bemoaned the fact that everybody had left the chamber, particularly the media, and gone to the Council to watch the debate there. I see this as an important issue and therefore want to make sure that we get the facts right. The members for West Swan and Warnbro referred to a number of reports set in 2011 and 2012. In this table I am holding, which I could table if members want, travel figures from Main Roads are listed for Monday to Friday during the morning peak period from 7.30 am to 9.00 am in August and March. They are gathered twice per financial year and then averaged. They exclude public holidays or events such as industrial action and school holidays. Looking across some of these reports, it is interesting that between 2009 and 2011–12—opposition members referred to a lot of reports from that period—travel time for those routes got worse before they became better. There is a history of work that has been undertaken by this government to ensure that we improve our roads and make it easier for people to move around and about our city.

Perth is a great city. I have travelled extensively and I must say that whenever I come back home, I am relieved to be back here. There is a lot we have to be proud of. I believe it is one of the most liveable cities in the world. At times when we are in this place we often forget that because we have a number of constituents coming to us about a number of issues. There are always ways we can improve, but when I sit back and reflect, I believe this is one the greatest cities on earth and we are very privileged to live in Perth. That is not to say that we cannot always improve and strive to do better, which is certainly something we are doing.

One thing we have found is that the Liberal government has had to play catch-up over the last few years due to a lack of action on roads around Perth. As we discussed yesterday in the debate on the matter of public interest, the audit report showed that there was a big backlog of maintenance across the road network throughout the state. We are looking at not only what we need to do to provide better roads and public transport infrastructure, but also how we can do things smarter with the existing infrastructure we have. I have often talked about the need for smarter roads and smarter public transport. We know that Perth's population has grown from 1.38 million people in 2001 to an estimated 1.97 million in 2013. We know time is of the essence and that time lost is lost productivity, particularly for businesses. We are also cognisant of the fact that 50 per cent of the vehicles registered in Western Australia are commercial vehicles and they are using our road infrastructure for day-to-day activities to grow businesses.

On this side of the chamber we have talked about the projects we are undertaking. For example, underway right at the moment, which everybody who heads at the airport has seen, is the \$1 billion Gateway WA project. That is a fantastic project that is nearly 12 months ahead of schedule and well under budget, and it has allowed us to fix up other black spots around the city, particularly the one on record at Roe Highway–Berkshire Road. That is the largest road project that this state has ever undertaken. Coupled with that we will have the largest public transport project that this government has ever undertaken, with the \$2 billion Forrestfield–Airport Link project.

Several members interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER (Mr N.W. Morton)**: Members! Member for West Swan, thank you.

**Mr D.C. NALDER**: This will establish a world-class public transport solution that goes to the airport. It will not only assist with the important tourism industry, but also open up the eastern corridor. This is the first government that has placed an emphasis on the eastern suburbs of Perth to allow that area to grow. To cut travel times from Forrestfield to the Perth CBD from 50 minutes to 24 minutes will well please the people from the eastern suburbs. Looking at the focus and attention that has historically been provided north and south, it is about time a government had the fortitude stand up for the eastern suburbs and put the infrastructure in place. We talk about

Mr Dean Nalder; Ms Rita Saffioti; Ms Simone McGurk; Acting Speaker; Mr Bill Johnston; Ms Margaret Quirk

---

the Gateway WA project being the largest Main Roads project ever undertaken, but at the end of this year we will go out to tender on four grade separations for the start of the NorthLink WA project.

A lot of the discussion in the last sitting about congestion centred on the member for West Swan looking at her area and the issues for her constituents in Ellenbrook. If the member is not already aware, I have a huge amount of pleasure in announcing that we will put a freeway through to Ellenbrook and Muchea. We will go out to tender at the end of this year for the grade separations on Benara Road, Collier Road, Morley Drive and Reid Highway. Commencing in 2016, we will then connect a dual freeway through to Ellenbrook and the single lane road each way going to Muchea. That is a \$1.126 billion project. This is about not only shifting freight through, but also relieving traffic pressure, particularly on Great Northern Highway. The member for Swan Hills has raised a number of concerns about the trucks and how they move along Great Northern Highway. It will also considerably improve congestion on West Swan Road and Lord Street. This one project alone is an important aspect around what the government is doing to support the needs of the broader community and the congestion that occurs in the whole breadth of our state.

Members talk about electorate projects, but it is not just that; it is about local safety. I had the pleasure recently of opening the \$8 million project for traffic lights at the intersection of Lord Street and Roe Highway. This was another black spot location where a considerable number of accidents occurred on a weekly basis. That project is delivered and done. Again, that supports the constituents in the electorate of the member for West Swan. On top of that, \$21 million was allocated to the Gngangara Road duplication project. We had to do that properly. I will explain one of the reasons it has taken so long, and I am sure the member for West Swan would know this.

**Ms R. Saffioti** interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Member for West Swan, you are already on two calls.

**Mr D.C. NALDER:** That project had to go through an area of state forest and we wanted to make sure that we followed proper process. We were not going to put our bulldozers through a state forest without following proper process. We apologised for the delay. It was not our intention to delay the project, but we were following proper procedure and doing the job properly. Those are examples of the government providing better roads. The Perth Freight Link is coming. That is a \$1.5 billion project that will connect roads through to our ports and provide not only greater access for heavy vehicle movements, but also a proper intersection at the premier hospital of this city. This project is not only shifting freight, but also saving lives. We need to move on that as quickly as possible, because the intersection of Roe Highway at Kwinana Freeway was set up so that it could not be extended across the freeway. It is disgraceful that the previous Labor government ensured that Roe Highway could not be extended across the freeway, because it will create a bottleneck on South Street around Fiona Stanley Hospital with an anticipated 115 000 daily visitors and 35 000 people working at the Murdoch precinct.

The Liberal–National government is doing a lot of things to provide better public transport and road infrastructure for this state. I could touch on a heap of other projects. The government will extend the rail line to Butler and continue extending Mitchel Freeway north. It is widening the freeway south through to Armadale Road. I know there are other issues, but these projects will provide better roads.

I also want to mention smarter roads and smarter public transport. I know it has bugged a few people when I have talked about small projects that in isolation do not deliver a lot, but when they are combined and the government implements them one after the other, their effect is felt throughout the city. From a trial of traffic-light synchronisation, the department has been able to deliver a six-minute travel time improvement on Canning Highway between Riseley and Henley Streets with an eight per cent increase in traffic flow. The department has also put a trial in place on Orrong Road and last week the government announced it would roll traffic-light sequencing out for another 90 traffic lights. The government knows that will have an impact. I have talked about clearways in the CBD. The opposition criticised that and said it would not deliver much for people. It bugs members opposite that the government is getting on with the little things. The government is about looking after the little things, and the big things will look after themselves. The government is also creating big infrastructure projects to allow this city to grow. It is focusing on what can be done for not only private vehicle usage, but also freight movement to allow for productivity, which supports jobs in this state. I think this is important.

Do we have a plan? My word we have a plan! The government continues to develop that plan and it will continue to grow. I have talked about “Directions 2031” in the past. It is being remodelled for a projected population of 2.7 million. I have asked the department not to stop there and to consider public transport options for populations of 3.5 million and five million. It is difficult to make precise projections for a larger population of five million because technology will evolve, but these plans need to be living documents that continue to evolve. I want the document to be aspirational. It might be beyond my lifetime, but what could be better than

Mr Dean Nalder; Ms Rita Saffioti; Ms Simone McGurk; Acting Speaker; Mr Bill Johnston; Ms Margaret Quirk

---

laying the foundations to move towards an aspirational future for Perth, which in 50 or 60 years' time could be a city of five million people,?

I will touch on a couple of other projects. It obviously aggravates members opposite when I talk about the little one-per-centers. People often say that sweet fish taste the best. The department has commenced on-ramp merger trials. A lot of people guffawed a merger trial. I will be honest, when I saw the proposal for a merger trial my initial response was, "Strewth, is this going to do anything?" The department was convinced this would work and commenced trialling it on three on-ramps. I am waiting for the official report on those trials, but I have been given an indication that it is working very positively on one trial in particular. I will give members the example I was provided. Traffic cameras were installed at the start of the trial. Prior to the implementation of merger lanes, every morning up to 50 cars were blocked on the on-ramp. Since the commencement of the trial, zero cars have been blocked on the on-ramp in the morning. I admit that when I have travelled back from Bunbury in the past few weeks, I have come across congestion at Russell and Gibbs Roads through to Berrigan Drive. Once I travel beyond Berrigan Drive coming into the city, I can see no reason for it to be congested and blocked. Everybody is convinced it is to do with the traffic merging off Armadale Road. We need to look at some of the bottlenecks and to work on improving them, but I stand by Main Roads data that despite an increased level of traffic on the roads, the time taken to get from point to point has decreased. The evidence suggests an improvement. It does not suggest that more cars are using rat runs. In fact, traffic-light synchronisation means fewer cars in side streets because of better traffic flow on the main highway.

We have talked about better roads, but it is also about buses, rail and light rail. As the Minister for Transport I wanted to understand why people consider trains to be the better public transport option than buses. We have a massive bus fleet that has increased by 20 per cent over the last five to six years. The government has overseen a huge amount of investment in buses and a bus replacement program. I came up with three reasons that people were concerned about using buses. The first is that buses can be caught in traffic jams. The second is that people do not know when the next bus will arrive. The bus routes all have different timetables and unless people are familiar with their local bus stop, they do not necessarily understand the timetable. The third is that buses wind their way to the destination; they do not go directly and can take a long time to get people to where they need to go. Recently, the department awarded a contract for GPS trackers for buses. It will install GPS trackers in every Transperth bus, which will feed through to the Right Move Perth app—the public transport app—and will allow people to see exactly where their bus is. The department knows that this will improve people's view of buses as a public transport option. The department also trialled a more direct bus route along Beaufort Street, which I have talked about a couple of times in this place. It is interesting that when the department ran a direct route into the city from Morley Galleria, the service ran every four minutes during peak period, but it now runs every three minutes. Interestingly, patronage on that bus has gone up 25 per cent. Now, 40 per cent of all people movement along Beaufort Street is on buses. If we can provide more direct routes, instead of having buses that wind their way through the community to get to a destination point, and if we can get buses moving along major arterial routes on a more regular basis, can we get increased levels of patronage? We have increased bus passenger numbers on Scarborough Beach Road, and I am looking at other sites. I want further analysis around this space, because it is an existing infrastructure that we are starting to think about in a smarter way to shift people across the state. As I said, this is about doing things in a better way by building the right infrastructure but doing things in a smarter way.

In addition, the department has introduced technology for the first time. By August 2014, the Right Move Perth app had been downloaded 33 671 times, 57 750 screens were viewed and 187 000 push notifications were sent. Since its launch, 1 171 000 personalised push notifications about incidents have been sent via the app. These are notifications about specific routes that commuters have added to the app. Recently, I launched a new app to enable people to identify before they leave home which car park in the CBD has vacancies, so they can map which car park to move towards. They will be colour coded so that people will know which car parks are nearly full.

There are 62 980 people who have registered for SmartParker, and 71 755 vehicles are registered for SmartParker, and 62 846 vehicles are currently activated. Smarter solutions are working alongside better solutions to create this government's transport plan for our city.

I could go on for a long time. Originally, I wanted to share with everybody the complete plan, but my commitment to the opposition was that I would speak for only 20 minutes on this motion. This government is doing an enormous amount. I will not go through all the different road programs, but we have brought to the fore and are now doing a number of road projects that were put on the backburner by the Labor government. I am happy to share the table if the opposition would like to look at it and analyse it further.

**Ms R. Saffioti:** Table it.

**Mr D.C. NALDER:** I will table it.

[See paper 2294.]

**Mr D.C. NALDER:** I will go over the facts. This government will spend \$1.9 billion on public transport infrastructure over the next four years, with \$209 million on the new bus port, which will be completed by mid-2016; \$57 million on the Aubin Grove station, which will be completed by the end of 2016; \$358 million for world-class transport services to the new stadium; and \$244 million to buy 22 three-car B-series trains. There has been a 28 per cent increase in the size of the Transperth railcar fleet and 123 buses have been added to the Transperth fleet this year, with 1.8 million new bus kilometres. There are more than 5 000 additional parking bays at train stations network-wide, which is 50 per cent more than our 2008 commitment. We know that there continues to be pressure, so we have had to retrofit some stations.

It is interesting that Labor tries to claim the space of public transport. The average growth under the Liberal-National government has been five per cent per annum. Under the previous Labor government, funding for buses was 1.4 per cent.

**Ms R. Saffioti:** Of what—1.4 per cent of what?

**Mr D.C. NALDER:** It is the level of spending per annum. The average growth in passenger funding for buses was 1.4 per cent per annum.

I will move to cycling. As I shared earlier during question time, this government is committed to spending \$100 million on cycling infrastructure over the next four years. We are working with every cycling body. They meet on a bimonthly basis to talk through exactly what we can do. We are continuing to look at ways to improve the infrastructure. We have plans to ensure that we create greater connections to the CBD within a 12-kilometre radius through principal shared paths. In addition, every time we build a major freeway or railway line, we extend the cycle paths. I have asked that consideration be given to widening them even further. A lot of the cycle paths are three metres wide, so I have asked that when we start the north link, we create a freeway to Ellenbrook. If the freeway extended all the way from Ellenbrook to Fremantle, people would be able to get on the Mitchell and Kwinana Freeways and then head to Mandurah or Bunbury or into the CBD without going through a set of lights. It will be an amazing experience and will be completed by the end of 2018. There are a massive number of principal shared paths.

**Mr R.F. Johnson:** I just hope that doesn't cause more congestion on the Mitchell Freeway when I come to work!

**Mr D.C. NALDER:** No, which is why we are also doing the freight link to shift the trucks off the Kwinana Freeway and push them down onto Stock Road, which has a six-lane reserve to the Kwinana Freeway.

**Mr R.F. Johnson:** I'm more worried about the Mitchell Freeway.

**Mr D.C. NALDER:** They will not come in on the Mitchell Freeway.

I am conscious of the time and my commitment to stick to 20 minutes, so I will wind up. As I shared earlier during question time, there are a number of projects around cycling.

I will finish on customer satisfaction, because, at the end of the day, that is what is really important—are customers satisfied? Interestingly, the twenty-fourth annual Transperth passenger satisfaction monitor revealed that train passenger satisfaction increased to 89 per cent in 2014 from 84 per cent in 2013, bus passenger satisfaction increased to 83 per cent from 81 per cent, and ferry passenger satisfaction increased to 97 per cent from 96 per cent. These figures complement this year's Canstar Blue result. Transperth won the award for most satisfied customers for the third time in a row.

I have talked about what we are doing with our plan for road and public transport infrastructure. In addition, we are also making smarter roads by using the existing infrastructure in a smarter way for the betterment of all Western Australians. We will continue to work on this to ensure that we provide a good environment for all users, irrespective of which mode of transport they choose to use.

**MS R. SAFFIOTI (West Swan)** [4.25 pm] — in reply: I rise to conclude the debate on the opposition's motion —

That this house condemns the Minister for Transport for his false claims that he has fixed congestion in Western Australia.

Again, it was a disappointing contribution —

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** Where have I said in *Hansard* that I fixed it?

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The minister has just had 25 minutes to address the issue, but he did not.

**Mr D.C. Nalder** interjected.

Mr Dean Nalder; Ms Rita Saffioti; Ms Simone McGurk; Acting Speaker; Mr Bill Johnston; Ms Margaret Quirk

---

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Mr Acting Speaker, I am not inviting interjections.

**The ACTING SPEAKER (Mr N.W. Morton):** The member is not inviting interjections. Thanks, minister.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The minister has just had 25 minutes to address this issue, but he failed to do so. Once again the minister has tried to launch some sort of political attack with some highly political notes provided by his advisers. Just saying that he has a plan does not mean that he has a plan. Just saying something does not mean it is true. The minister comes into this place again and again and tries to be the political headkicker of the government. But when he does that, he should not read the notes line by line—Labor is bad, Labor is bad, Labor is bad. It does not work.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Members, the conversations are a little distracting.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Is it a good party?

Several members interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Now it is more distracting, member for West Swan!

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** I would expect more from my good friend the member for Swan Hills.

A member interjected.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** He is out of his seat, Mr Acting Speaker. This is crazy stuff!

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Back to the motion, member.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** It is disappointing because when the minister says that he has a plan but does not release it and does not talk about it but just goes through a list of things, it again demonstrates that the government has not produced a comprehensive plan to address congestion throughout the metropolitan area. I find it offensive that the minister comes into this place and talks about public transport and bus figures during Labor's time in government, but tries to gloss over the fact that we built nearly 100 kilometres of train track during those eight years. He seems to have completely disregarded that fact.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** It was commenced by which government?

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Come on!

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** Did you like the acknowledgement we provided to Labor about Fiona Stanley Hospital at the opening?

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Although I was part of the Reid review, I was not invited, minister. I was part of the Reid review that recommended the construction of that hospital, but I was not invited, so I do not know; I was not there. Yes, I was part of the Reid review that recommended the new hospital, but I was not invited, so I do not know who was acknowledged and, frankly, I do not care.

The Minister for Transport talks about public transport as though he has achieved something. He has built 8.5 kilometres of train track but he could not even do that properly. I cannot comprehend that he built 8.5 kilometres of train track to Butler but he could not put the right matting underneath it.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** At least you're acknowledging it went to Butler! Your one nearly went to Rockingham and nearly went to Mandurah.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** That is an interesting interjection from the minister. He has claimed that the Mandurah rail line did not go to Mandurah. That is not something I have ever heard the member for Mandurah say. In the minister's proposed Forrestfield rail line plan, what suburb is the Forrestfield rail station in? It is not in Forrestfield, I can tell the minister that! It is funny, because it is not in Forrestfield.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** It is in the electorate of Forrestfield.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** It is in the electorate of Forrestfield! The minister comes into this place again and again with his goofy interjections about the 70-kilometre Mandurah railway line not going into Mandurah, and then talks about a Forrestfield train station that is not even in the suburb of Forrestfield. The minister has misled the public. What suburb is the Belmont train station in? Does anyone have any guesses? It is not in Belmont. This minister comes in —

**Dr A.D. Buti:** It is in the electorate of Belmont.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** This is the first time I have seen train stations named after electorates and not suburbs.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** No, it is not, because you named it Forrestfield. In your election material it was named Forrestfield.

Mr Dean Nalder; Ms Rita Saffioti; Ms Simone McGurk; Acting Speaker; Mr Bill Johnston; Ms Margaret Quirk

---

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** It is. Member for Mandurah, he is insulting the Mandurah railway line again. He is insulting —

*Point of Order*

**Ms S.F. McGURK:** I sit here and listen to a lot of debates, but the number of interjections by the minister is unnecessary. He has had a chance to make his arguments in this debate. Could I ask you, as Acting Speaker, to ask the minister to cease the interjections? It is very hard to follow.

**The ACTING SPEAKER (Mr N.W. Morton):** The member for West Swan initially said that she was not taking interjections and then started responding to the minister. If the member for West Swan does not want to receive interjections from the minister, she should direct her comments through the Chair. Minister, I ask you to refrain from interjecting.

*Debate Resumed*

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** I will accept your ruling, but given that every day in question time when we are invited to interject and we do, we get called to order, I find it interesting.

The minister comes in and completely ignores the fact that we built nearly 100 kilometres of train track during our term. He talks about bus patronage figures going up by only 1.5 per cent in our term. That is because we built a massive new train line; some people got off buses and onto trains and that affected the bus patronage numbers. The minister should not come in here and talk about bus patronage figures for our eight years and ignore the fact that we built the Perth–Mandurah train line, because that is misleading.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** And failed to put in the buses to connect to it.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Honestly, this comes from someone who has done nothing, and then failed to build 8.5 kilometres of train track to Butler that does not make all the houses vibrate. Can members believe that? The only thing the government has done is build 8.5 kilometres of railway line, and it did not put the matting underneath.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** You tell them —

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** I will tell them what? I will tell the residents whom the minister has not visited about the vibration. The member for Butler has commented that the government built 8.5 kilometres of train track and it did not putting matting underneath to stop the vibrations.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** I did not realise there was matting under the Mandurah railway line.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The Minister for Transport has not taken seriously the issues raised by the member for Butler. He is too busy trying to prepare political counter-attacks.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** That is not true. We are getting a report done. We are doing an official study.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Go and meet them; do your job! I wish the Minister for Transport would do his job and meet those people and discuss their concerns. The Minister for Transport comes in here and ignores the entire Perth–Mandurah train line and states that the Mandurah railway line does not go right into the city centre of Mandurah. The key point I want to make is that the minister has announced a Forrestfield railway line that does not go to Forrestfield. It does not go to the suburb of Forrestfield. He has announced a Belmont train station that is not in the suburb of Belmont.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** Look at your election material.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Minister for Transport, let us not talk about election material, because the government's announcement is nothing like its election material. It is another unfunded and uncosted promise.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** Careful of that one. I have the numbers of yours.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** So do I. The government did not have the \$2.2 billion project costed by Treasury and the minister still cannot tell us what that \$2.2 billion represents. He comes in and tells us to be careful because he has our numbers. I have our numbers too! The minister should take some time and do his job properly instead of trying to be some sort of pathetic headkicker who reads attack lines, line by line, such as "Labor is bad", thinking that that works in this place. That does not cut it.

**Mr D.C. Nalder** interjected.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The minister talked about the Forrestfield railway line being the largest rail project undertaken in Western Australia. It might be the most costly, but it is not the largest. Tunnelling through the city centre, creating two new city stations and building 70 kilometres of train track to Mandurah is a slightly bigger project. The minister comes in here and says that the government is undertaking the biggest rail project in the

Mr Dean Nalder; Ms Rita Saffioti; Ms Simone McGurk; Acting Speaker; Mr Bill Johnston; Ms Margaret Quirk

---

state's history, but that is not true; it may be the biggest in cost, but not in any other sort of figure, such as patronage, number of stations, kilometres—you name it.

**Mr D.C. Nalder** interjected.

*Point of Order*

**Mr W.J. JOHNSTON:** The minister is constantly interjecting and I would ask for him to be called to order.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** The member for West Swan has continued to engage with the minister. I have asked all members to cease interjecting, but the member for West Swan has continued after that ruling to engage with the Minister for Transport.

**Mr W.J. JOHNSTON:** Further to my point of order, the Speaker constantly reminds us during question time that it does not matter whether a member names us; that does not give us any excuse to interject. I am asking for the same rules that are applied to us to be applied to this minister.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** The member for West Swan has the call and I would like to hear from the member for West Swan.

*Debate Resumed*

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** The minister allowed me to collect some further thoughts about his criticism of our rail project and our commitments. Remember the \$1.8 billion—whatever it was costed at at the time—railway project to the airport that does not look anything like the project that the government has just announced. The member for Cannington has asked a number of questions about projected boardings and other key issues regarding that train line, but the minister cannot give us any details on those issues. We know that Treasury did not cost it. We do not know the breakdown of \$2.2 billion. The minister misled us by getting confused about boardings and daily trips, and now he cannot give us a breakdown of where those boardings were coming from. The government went to make an announcement and it cannot give us a breakdown of those figures, yet the minister has the audacity to criticise our record on transport.

Let us go through it again. Government members like to stand and talk about the Great Eastern Highway upgrade and the Gateway WA project, but those two projects were funded and initiated by federal Labor. The minister talks about the government giving some credit to someone at Fiona Stanley Hospital, yet he stands and claims credit for a project that was almost entirely funded by the federal Labor government and that the state Liberal–National government rallied against. The minister talks about the NorthLinkWA project. Those three overpasses at Benara Road, Collier Road and Morley Drive were funded by federal Labor. NorthLink, or what was then known as the Perth–Darwin highway, was funded by federal Labor.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** That's not right.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Yes, it was.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** It was jointly funded.

*Point of Order*

**Ms M.M. QUIRK:** Mr Acting Speaker, I certainly heard your ruling fewer than five minutes ago. The minister continues to interject despite your ruling and I would like you, Mr Acting Speaker, to remind the minister that you made an unambiguous ruling.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Minister, please refrain from interjecting.

*Debate Resumed*

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** That was funded by federal Labor. I did not interject when the minister was on his feet, as I recall.

The government is completely rewriting history. The minister standing and reading out some notes does not mean it is true; it is not convincing anyone, particularly the people in this place. The minister referred to the Liberal government having to play catch-up on transport. In eight years it has delivered 8.5 kilometres of train track throughout the entire metropolitan area. The catch-up will be done by a state Labor government that will need to invest in rail infrastructure throughout our networks.

The minister talks about the Liberal government playing catch-up on transport. In eight years, the government has delivered 8.5 kilometres of train track throughout the entire metropolitan area. The catch-up on transport will be done by a state Labor government that will need to invest in rail infrastructure throughout the network. The minister talks about maintenance. This government addresses maintenance by cutting maintenance funding in the forward estimates. It is cutting funding to councils for local government roads. The minister refers to the one-per-centers and smarter roads, because there is no plan. Use a key line; it is an episode of *Utopia*. When all else fails, get a catchy name; let us call them the one-per-centers.

Mr Dean Nalder; Ms Rita Saffioti; Ms Simone McGurk; Acting Speaker; Mr Bill Johnston; Ms Margaret Quirk

---

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** Smarter roads.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** There we go; smarter roads. I am not inviting the member's interjection. Let us give them some key words —

Several members interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Members, thank you.

**Ms M.M. Quirk** interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** That applies to all members, thanks, member for Girrawheen.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** I will take that interjection. Where is the government's plan? Where is the draft plan that the government released in 2011 that it is trying to rewrite and rework? Where is the draft plan that stated that the Ellenbrook bus rapid transit way, Metro Area Express light rail and Yanchep extension were the three priority projects that provided the best cost-benefit ratio of any project in the state, which the government has abandoned? The Liberal Party took the MAX light rail project to the state election and said that commuters would be catching MAX light rail by 2018, but the project has now been abandoned. Today, the Minister for Transport basically said that MAX is dead when he talked about buses using bus lanes and that maybe that is enough. Members opposite promised an airport rail line on a route that would be fully funded and fully costed and delivered by 2018, but that has now disappeared. Animations were made for a bus rapid transit system to Ellenbrook that was pulled at the last minute. Animations and plans were made for the connection of the southern rail link to the Armadale line, which was completely abandoned, even though it was a key promise made by the member for Southern River. How about that? Before members opposite ask about Labor's plan for transport, they should look in their own backyard where there is chaos and dysfunction all over the place.

The minister believes that the issue of rat runs has been solved; they are no longer an issue. Again, he is ignoring the facts and what is happening out there in the community. Rat runs through my electorate, the member for Cannington's electorate and many other members' electorates continue to be a major issue. In relation to NorthLink, there is a massive congestion issue at West Swan Road and Lord Street. Another part of that jigsaw needs to be put in place. The government cannot just say that NorthLink will fix all the problems, because it will not. There needs to be further expansion of Lord Street or a reconfiguration of roads in the area to ensure that traffic in that area is dealt with. It is yet another disappointing response. The minister who has delivered nothing came into this place and attacked Labor's record on public transport. He talked about one-per-centers, because he has not delivered a comprehensive plan. The minister sits in this chamber, with his Forrestfield rail line costed at \$2.2 billion, but we do not know whether Treasury has costed that project or the breakdown of the costs. The minister confused boardings and daily trips and cannot say how he got to those figures anyway. He comes into this chamber and tries to attack Labor. To be taken seriously as a minister—I will refer to the Minister for Planning and how he dealt with my matter of public interest. The Minister for Planning referred to a key document—a review of road safety in Western Australia. He addressed the issue I raised seriously. He made some political points, but fair enough, this is Parliament. However, a minister stood and tried to kick Labor when his government is failing all over the place. The government cannot even deliver 8.5 kilometres of train track without stuffing it up by failing to put matting in the key places. The minister has not met with the residents to address this issue properly. The minister has not been able to do that, yet he comes into this place with his pathetic attempted attacks on Labor. He pulls out figures on bus patronage over eight years, but he ignores the fact that we built the Mandurah rail line and the Clarkson and Thornlie extensions.

**Mr J. Norberger:** Well, why won't anybody vote for you?

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** I am here. If the member wants to talk about voting, go and have a look at that Newspoll, my friend. The member should seriously consider that Newspoll. I was not going to raise it, but if the member wants to talk about polls, he should go look at that latest Newspoll, because he will not be here!

*Point of Order*

**Mr D.C. NALDER:** Mr Acting Speaker, I am not sure what this has to do with the motion as far as congestion goes. The motion is about congestion.

Several members interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER (Mr N.W. Morton):** Members, the point of order will be heard in silence, thank you.

**Mr D.C. NALDER:** Thank you, Mr Acting Speaker. I think the motion is to do with congestion and we are moving into all sorts of areas that have no relevance to the debate.

**Ms S.F. McGurk** interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Member for Fremantle, points of order will be heard in silence.

Mr Dean Nalder; Ms Rita Saffioti; Ms Simone McGurk; Acting Speaker; Mr Bill Johnston; Ms Margaret Quirk

---

**Mr W.J. JOHNSTON:** The member is responding to the question in the motion about false claims. I think her comments are exactly relevant to her resolution to condemn the Minister for Transport for his false claims that he has fixed congestion. The member for Joondalup raised issues about the government's failures and the member properly responded to those issues.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** I do not quite follow that, but I have said that we do not want interjections from the chamber. The member for West Swan has the call.

*Debate Resumed*

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Let us bring it back to congestion. It is congested because of all the people running away from the Liberal Party at the moment. The number of people —

Several members interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Member for West Swan, people continue to interject. Member for Armadale, I just made a ruling on interjections and the first thing you did was pipe up. Please, the member for West Swan has the call and I would like to hear from the member for West Swan. Members also need to take into account that Hansard is trying to record this.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Sure, Mr Acting Speaker, but you allowed the interjections, so this is what has happened.

In relation to congestion, like I said, the congestion that I see is the number of people who are rushing to say that the Premier is not good at his job.

**Mr J. Norberger** interjected.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** What was that?

Several members interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** I did not hear the comment.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** We were still here when the tide was out; the tide is not going to be going the member's way this time, I tell him now.

**Mr D.A. Templeman** interjected.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Member for Mandurah, I call you to order for the first time. Excuse me?

**Mr W.J. Johnston:** I said, "Oh, come on."

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** I call you to order, too, member for Cannington, and that is for the third time. I will not have reference made to the rulings of the Chair. Your contribution has 27 minutes, and I do not wish to hear interjections from the chamber.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** This is a government without a plan that has failed to deliver in any real way. The minister talked about the delivery of light rail. I think he used the past tense—"delivered light rail". It was in a TV ad. Public transport has never been the Liberal Party's strong suit. The only projects that it can point to were funded and initiated by federal Labor.

I want to talk about the eastern suburbs. The Liberal Party is trying to run a key line that it is the only party that cares about the east. Look at Midland: police and Landgate are both initiatives undertaken by Labor. Midland now has the hospital. The hospital was a part of the Reid review, which I sat on, that recommended a rebuild of a Midland hospital. Thanks a lot; the Reid review undertook good work, frankly. I sat on the Reid review for a number of years.

**Mr D.C. Nalder:** Another dream.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** I thank the member for the interjection, I will take that one.

What did the government do? Before the election the Premier said that he would build a university in Midland. I saw the wry smile of the member for Swan Hills! We are waiting for that university. A key election promise of the government was to build a university. Remember the 50 election commitments the government claimed it delivered? Midland university was on that list, and I think the election material said that it was "underway".

**Mr D.A. Templeman:** It was.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Yes.

**Dr A.D. Buti:** The virtual university.

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** Yes, the virtual university.

**Mr F.A. Alban:** Tell me about all the good things you did, member for West Swan?

Mr Dean Nalder; Ms Rita Saffioti; Ms Simone McGurk; Acting Speaker; Mr Bill Johnston; Ms Margaret Quirk

---

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Member for Swan Hills, I call you to order for the first time.

*Point of Order*

**Mr W.J. JOHNSTON:** On a point of order, I note that that was the third member of the Liberal Party to interject on the member for West Swan.

**The ACTING SPEAKER:** Thanks for keeping count, member for Cannington.

*Debate Resumed*

**Ms R. SAFFIOTI:** In response to the member for Swan Hills's interjection: Ellenbrook Secondary College, about four primary schools, the police station and the Reid Highway–Middle Swan Bridge. They are the things committed to under the former state Labor government, even though the Liberal–National government is claiming credit for a number of them.

It has been a fiery debate, but the minister's performance has been disappointing. He should get across his portfolio, deliver in key areas and not use key lines run from a bad *Utopia* episode. He should not come in here and try to be a headkicker or read from his key documents all the time because it does not work. I know he is practising every day, but his performance is not getting any better. This motion states that this government has failed to fix congestion and has no real plan to fix it. For the minister to say that the government has fixed rat runs is another stretch of the truth. It is another exaggeration on which the opposition will continue to hold the government to account.

*Division*

Question put and a division taken, the Acting Speaker (Mr N.W. Morton) casting his vote with the noes, with the following result —

Ayes (18)

Dr A.D. Buti  
Mr R.H. Cook  
Ms J. Farrer  
Ms J.M. Freeman  
Mr W.J. Johnston

Mr D.J. Kelly  
Mr M. McGowan  
Ms S.F. McGurk  
Mr M.P. Murray  
Mr P. Papalia

Mr J.R. Quigley  
Ms M.M. Quirk  
Mrs M.H. Roberts  
Ms R. Saffioti  
Mr C.J. Tallentire

Mr P.B. Watson  
Mr B.S. Wyatt  
Mr D.A. Templeman (*Teller*)

Noes (30)

Mr P. Abetz  
Mr F.A. Alban  
Mr I.C. Blayney  
Mr I.M. Britza  
Mr G.M. Castrilli  
Mr V.A. Catania  
Mr M.J. Cowper  
Ms M.J. Davies

Mr J.H.D. Day  
Ms E. Evangel  
Mr J.M. Francis  
Mrs G.J. Godfrey  
Dr K.D. Hames  
Mr C.D. Hatton  
Mr A.P. Jacob  
Mr R.F. Johnson

Mr S.K. L'Estrange  
Mr R.S. Love  
Mr W.R. Marmion  
Mr J.E. McGrath  
Mr P.T. Miles  
Ms A.R. Mitchell  
Mr N.W. Morton  
Mr D.C. Nalder

Mr J. Norberger  
Mr D.T. Redman  
Mr A.J. Simpson  
Mr M.H. Taylor  
Mr T.K. Waldron  
Mr A. Krsticevic (*Teller*)

---

Pairs

Mr P.C. Tinley  
Ms L.L. Baker  
Mr F.M. Logan

Mrs L.M. Harvey  
Dr G.G. Jacobs  
Ms W.M. Duncan

Question thus negatived.